# Nonparametric regression–Estimation, inference, and effects

StataCorp LLC

May 09, 2018

(StataCorp LLC)

May 09, 2018 1 / 69

A .

#### Why is nonparametric regression relevant?

- Nonparametric regression is agnostic
- Unlike parametric estimation, nonparametric regression assumes no functional form for the relationship between outcomes and covariates.
- You do not need to know the functional form to answer important research questions
- You are not subject to problems that arise from misspecification

A (10) A (10)

- Why is nonparametric regression relevant?
- Nonparametric regression is agnostic
- Unlike parametric estimation, nonparametric regression assumes no functional form for the relationship between outcomes and covariates.
- You do not need to know the functional form to answer important research questions
- You are not subject to problems that arise from misspecification

- Why is nonparametric regression relevant?
- Nonparametric regression is agnostic
- Unlike parametric estimation, nonparametric regression assumes no functional form for the relationship between outcomes and covariates.
- You do not need to know the functional form to answer important research questions
- You are not subject to problems that arise from misspecification

- Why is nonparametric regression relevant?
- Nonparametric regression is agnostic
- Unlike parametric estimation, nonparametric regression assumes no functional form for the relationship between outcomes and covariates.
- You do not need to know the functional form to answer important research questions
- You are not subject to problems that arise from misspecification

#### • Some parametric functional form assumptions.

- regression:  $E(Y|X) = X\beta$
- probit:  $E(Y|X) = \Phi(X\beta)$
- Poisson:  $E(Y|X) = \exp(X\beta)$

• The relationship of interest is also a conditional mean:

$$E\left(y|X\right) = g\left(X\right)$$

• Where the mean function  $g(\cdot)$  is unknown

A (10) A (10)

- Some parametric functional form assumptions.
  - regression:  $E(Y|X) = X\beta$
  - probit:  $E(Y|X) = \Phi(X\beta)$
  - Poisson:  $E(Y|X) = \exp(X\beta)$
- The relationship of interest is also a conditional mean:

$$E\left(y|X\right) = g\left(X\right)$$

• Where the mean function  $g(\cdot)$  is unknown

< 🗇 🕨 < 🖻 🕨 <

- Some parametric functional form assumptions.
  - regression:  $E(Y|X) = X\beta$
  - probit:  $E(Y|X) = \Phi(X\beta)$
  - Poisson:  $E(Y|X) = \exp(X\beta)$
- The relationship of interest is also a conditional mean:

 $E\left(y|X\right) = g\left(X\right)$ 

• Where the mean function  $g(\cdot)$  is unknown

A (10) > A (10) > A (10)

- Some parametric functional form assumptions.
  - regression:  $E(Y|X) = X\beta$
  - probit:  $E(Y|X) = \Phi(X\beta)$
  - Poisson:  $E(Y|X) = \exp(X\beta)$
- The relationship of interest is also a conditional mean:

$$E\left(y|X\right)=g\left(X\right)$$

• Where the mean function  $g(\cdot)$  is unknown

- **→ → →** 

- In the parametric models  $\beta$  fully characterizes the mean function
- We work hard to look and understand  $\beta$
- Most of the interesting questions and results are inferences about the relationship of interest, the mean function.
- The answers to these questions is not  $\beta_i$
- Nonparametric regression invites us to think in terms of the questions of interest
- Nonparametric regression invites you to think about inference not about parameters

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

- In the parametric models  $\beta$  fully characterizes the mean function
- We work hard to look and understand  $\beta$
- Most of the interesting questions and results are inferences about the relationship of interest, the mean function.
- The answers to these questions is not β<sub>i</sub>
- Nonparametric regression invites us to think in terms of the questions of interest
- Nonparametric regression invites you to think about inference not about parameters

- 4 回 ト 4 回 ト

- In the parametric models  $\beta$  fully characterizes the mean function
- We work hard to look and understand  $\beta$
- Most of the interesting questions and results are inferences about the relationship of interest, the mean function.
- The answers to these questions is not  $\beta_i$
- Nonparametric regression invites us to think in terms of the questions of interest
- Nonparametric regression invites you to think about inference not about parameters

A (10) A (10) A (10) A

- In the parametric models  $\beta$  fully characterizes the mean function
- We work hard to look and understand  $\beta$
- Most of the interesting questions and results are inferences about the relationship of interest, the mean function.
- The answers to these questions is not  $\beta_i$
- Nonparametric regression invites us to think in terms of the questions of interest
- Nonparametric regression invites you to think about inference not about parameters

A (10) A (10) A (10) A

- In the parametric models  $\beta$  fully characterizes the mean function
- We work hard to look and understand  $\beta$
- Most of the interesting questions and results are inferences about the relationship of interest, the mean function.
- The answers to these questions is not  $\beta_i$
- Nonparametric regression invites us to think in terms of the questions of interest
- Nonparametric regression invites you to think about inference not about parameters

A (10) A (10)

# To Summarize the Discussion



イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

# Traditional Approach to Nonparametric Estimation

#### • A cross section of counties

- citations: Number of monthly drunk driving citations
- fines: The value of fines imposed in a county in thousands of dollars if caught drinking and driving.

# Traditional Approach to Nonparametric Estimation

- A cross section of counties
- citations: Number of monthly drunk driving citations
- fines: The value of fines imposed in a county in thousands of dollars if caught drinking and driving.

# **Implicit Relation**



# Simple linear regression



(StataCorp LLC)

May 09, 2018 8 / 69

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト

# Regression with nonlinearities



(StataCorp LLC)

May 09, 2018 9 / 69

• • • • • • • • • • • •

# **Poisson regression**



# Nonparametric Estimation of Mean Function

lpoly citations fines

.



#### Now That We have the Mean Function

• What is the effect on the mean of citations of increasing fines by 10% ?



#### Traditional Approach Gives Us



• • • • • • • • • • •

## **Additional Variables**

- I would like to add controls
  - Whether county has a college town college
  - Number of highway patrol patrols units per capita in the county
- With those controls I can ask some new questions

• What is the mean of citations if I increase patrols and fines ?



• How does the mean of citations differ for counties where there is a college town, averaging out the effect of patrols and fines?



• What policy has a bigger effect on the mean of citations, an increase in fines, an increase in patrols, or a combination of both?



#### What We Have Is



(StataCorp LLC)

- I have a mean function. That makes no functional form assumptions.
- I cannot answer the previous questions.
- My analysis was graphical not statistical
- My analysis is limited to one covariate
- This is true even if I give you the true mean function, g(X)

- I have a mean function. That makes no functional form assumptions.
- I cannot answer the previous questions.
- My analysis was graphical not statistical
- My analysis is limited to one covariate
- This is true even if I give you the true mean function, g(X)

- I have a mean function. That makes no functional form assumptions.
- I cannot answer the previous questions.
- My analysis was graphical not statistical
- My analysis is limited to one covariate
- This is true even if I give you the true mean function, g(X)

- I have a mean function. That makes no functional form assumptions.
- I cannot answer the previous questions.
- My analysis was graphical not statistical
- My analysis is limited to one covariate
- This is true even if I give you the true mean function, g(X)

- I have a mean function. That makes no functional form assumptions.
- I cannot answer the previous questions.
- My analysis was graphical not statistical
- My analysis is limited to one covariate
- This is true even if I give you the true mean function, g(X)

#### npregress

 New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation

- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics,

- 4 回 ト 4 回 ト

#### npregress

- New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation
- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences using the mean function
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete covariates
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question and get inferences using your estimator.
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics, estimation, and inference

A (10) A (10) A (10) A
- New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation
- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences using the mean function
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete covariates
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question and get inferences using your estimator.
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics, estimation, and inference

< 口 > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

- New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation
- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences using the mean function
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete covariates
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question and get inferences using your estimator.
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics, estimation, and inference

- New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation
- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences using the mean function
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete covariates
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question and get inferences using your estimator.
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics, estimation, and inference

- New command in Stata 15 for nonparametric regression estimation
- We will be able to answer these question and make inferences using the mean function
- We will be able to include multiple continuous and discrete covariates
- npregress is an estimator not just a graphical tool
- It is a Stata estimator. You are going to be able to ask question and get inferences using your estimator.
- Stata is unique in being able to provide nonparametric graphics. estimation, and inference

く 同 ト く ヨ ト く ヨ ト

# Nonparametric Estimation Intuition

A .

## Nonparametric regression: discrete covariates

#### Mean function for a discrete covariate

• Mean (probability) of low birthweight (lbweight) conditional on smoking 1 to 5 cigarettes (msmoke=1) during pregnancy

- regress lbweight 1.msmoke, noconstant
- *E*(*lbweigth*|*msmoke* = 1), nonparametric estimate

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

Nonparametric regression: discrete covariates

Mean function for a discrete covariate

• Mean (probability) of low birthweight (lbweight) conditional on smoking 1 to 5 cigarettes (msmoke=1) during pregnancy

• regress lbweight 1.msmoke, noconstant

• *E*(*lbweigth*|*msmoke* = 1), nonparametric estimate

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

Nonparametric regression: discrete covariates

Mean function for a discrete covariate

• Mean (probability) of low birthweight (lbweight) conditional on smoking 1 to 5 cigarettes (msmoke=1) during pregnancy

| . mean lbweig  | ght if | msmoke | ==1  |        |        |       |           |
|----------------|--------|--------|------|--------|--------|-------|-----------|
| Mean estimatio | on     |        |      | Number | of obs | =     | 480       |
|                |        | Mean   | Std. | Err.   | [95%   | Conf. | Interval] |
| lbweight       |        | .1125  | .014 | 4375   | .0841  | 313   | .1408687  |

- regress lbweight 1.msmoke, noconstant
- *E*(*lbweigth*|*msmoke* = 1), nonparametric estimate

A (10) A (10)

- Iow birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- E(lbweight|fincome = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- $|fincome_i 10.819| \le h$
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

- low birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- E(lbweight|fincome = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- $|fincome_i 10.819| \le h$
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

- low birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- E(lbweight|fincome = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- $|fincome_i 10.819| \le h$
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

- low birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- *E*(*lbweight*|*fincome* = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- |fincome<sub>i</sub> 10.819| ≤ h
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

- low birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- *E*(*lbweight*|*fincome* = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- |*fincome<sub>i</sub>* 10.819| ≤ *h*
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

- low birthweight conditional on log of family income fincome
- *E*(*lbweight*|*fincome* = 10.819)
- Take observations near the value of 10.819 and then take an average
- |*fincome<sub>i</sub>* 10.819| ≤ *h*
- *h* is a small number referred to as the bandwidth

### Graphical representation



(StataCorp LLC)

▲ ▶ ▲ 王 ▶ 王 夕々で May 09, 2018 24 / 69

• • • • • • • • •

÷

## Graphical example



(StataCorp LLC)

2 May 09, 2018 25 / 69

ъ

## Graphical example continued



## Two concepts

### 🛈 h !!!!

### 2 Definition of distance between points, $|x_i - x| \le h$

## Kernel weights

### • Epanechnikov

#### Gaussian

- Epanechnikov2
- Rectangular(Uniform)
- Triangular
- Biweight
- Triweight
- Cosine
- Parzen

э

< (T) > <

## Kernel weights

- Epanechnikov
- Gaussian
- Epanechnikov2
- Rectangular(Uniform)
- Triangular
- Biweight
- Triweight
- Cosine
- Parzen

A .

## **Discrete bandwidths**

#### • Li-Racine Kernel

$$k\left(\cdot\right) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x_i = x \\ h & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Cell mean

$$k(\cdot) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x_i = x \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

 Cell mean was used in the example of discrete covariate estimate E(lbweigth|msmoke = 1)

A (1) > A (1) > A

## **Discrete bandwidths**

#### • Li-Racine Kernel

$$k\left(\cdot
ight)=\left\{egin{array}{cc} 1 & ext{if} & x_{i}=x\ h & ext{otherwise} \end{array}
ight.$$

Cell mean

$$k(\cdot) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } x_i = x \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

 Cell mean was used in the example of discrete covariate estimate *E*(*lbweigth*|*msmoke* = 1)

## Selecting The Bandwidth

- A very large bandwidth will give you a biased estimate of the mean function with a small variance
- A very small bandwidth will give you an estimate with small bias and large variance

## Selecting The Bandwidth

- A very large bandwidth will give you a biased estimate of the mean function with a small variance
- A very small bandwidth will give you an estimate with small bias and large variance

## A Large Bandwidth At One Point



• • • • • • • • • •

## A Large Bandwidth At Two Points



### No Variance but Huge Bias



## A Very Small Bandwidth at a Point



### A Very Small Bandwidth at 4 Points



(StataCorp LLC)

May 09, 2018 35 / 69

### Small Bias Large Variance



### Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.
- Local-linear regression is the default

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.
- Local-linear regression is the default

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.
- Local-linear regression is the default

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.
- Local-linear regression is the default

< 回 > < 回 > < 回 >

Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.

• Local-linear regression is the default

< 回 > < 回 > < 回 >

Choose bandwidth optimally. Minimize bias-variance trade-off

- Cross-validation (default)
- Improved AIC (IMAIC)
- Compute a mean for every point in data (local-constant)
- Compute a regression for every point in data (local linear)
  - Computes constant (mean) and slope (effects)
  - Mean function and derivatives and effects of mean function
  - There is a bandwidth for the mean computation and another for the effects.
- Local-linear regression is the default

A D A D A D A
# Nonparametric Estimation With npregress



A (1) > A (2) > A

# The Data

- lbweight: 1 if low birthweight baby
- msmoke: cigarettes smoked during pregnancy (3 categories)
- mage: mother's age
- medu: mother's educational attainment
- alcohol: 1 if alcohol is consumed during pregnancy

#### npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol

- kernel refers to the kind of nonparametric estimation
- By default Stata assumes variables in my model are continuous
- i.msmoke States the variable is categorical
- Interactions between continuous variables and between continuous and discrete variables are implicit

< 回 ト < 三 ト < 三

npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol

#### • kernel refers to the kind of nonparametric estimation

- By default Stata assumes variables in my model are continuous
- i.msmoke States the variable is categorical
- Interactions between continuous variables and between continuous and discrete variables are implicit

< 回 ト < 三 ト < 三

npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol

- kernel refers to the kind of nonparametric estimation
- By default Stata assumes variables in my model are continuous
- i.msmoke States the variable is categorical
- Interactions between continuous variables and between continuous and discrete variables are implicit

npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol

- kernel refers to the kind of nonparametric estimation
- By default Stata assumes variables in my model are continuous
- i.msmoke States the variable is categorical
- Interactions between continuous variables and between continuous and discrete variables are implicit

npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol

- kernel refers to the kind of nonparametric estimation
- By default Stata assumes variables in my model are continuous
- i.msmoke States the variable is categorical
- Interactions between continuous variables and between continuous and discrete variables are implicit

#### npregress Bandwidth

. npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol Computing mean function

Minimizing cross-validation function:

| Iteration | 0:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.7960703 |
|-----------|-----|------------------|-----------|---|------------|
| Iteration | 1:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8051048 |
| Iteration | 2:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8051048 |
| Iteration | 3:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8097678 |
| Iteration | 4:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8161976 |
| Iteration | 5:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8295231 |
| Iteration | 6:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8295231 |
| Iteration | 7:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8327629 |
| Iteration | 8:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8327629 |
| Iteration | 9:  | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8344806 |
| Iteration | 10: | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8348909 |
| Iteration | 11: | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8348909 |
| Iteration | 12: | Cross-validation | criterion | = | -1.8348909 |
|           |     |                  |           |   |            |

Computing optimal derivative bandwidth

```
Iteration 0: Cross-validation criterion = 1.0020523
Iteration 1: Cross-validation criterion = .997563
Iteration 2: Cross-validation criterion = .99756116
```

#### npregress Output

Bandwidth

|   | Mean  | Effect                                       |   |             |                          |
|---|---|--|---|-------------|--------------------------|
| mage<br>medu<br>msmoke<br>alcohol                             | 3.149233<br>1.092557<br>.4397903<br>.0369884          | 36.95622<br>12.82115<br>.4397903<br>.0369884 |   |             |                          |
| Local-linear<br>Continuous kei<br>Discrete kerne<br>Bandwidth | regression<br>rnel : epanec<br>el : liraci<br>: cross | chnikov<br>ine<br>validation                 | Number of obs<br>E(Kernel obs)<br>R-squared | =<br>=<br>= | 1,000<br>1,000<br>0.4215 |
| lbweight  | Estimate  |  |   |             |                          |
| Mean<br>lbweight  | .0964155  |  |   |             |                          |
| Effect<br>mage<br>medu  | 002998<br>023344                                      |  |   |             |                          |
| msmoke<br>(1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 0)                             | .0969135<br>.2136147                                  |  |   |             |                          |
| alcohol<br>(yes vs no)  | .2147543  |  |   |             |                          |

Note: Effect estimates are averages of derivatives for continuous covariates and averages of contrasts for factor covariates.

Note: You may compute standard errors using vce(bootstrap) or reps().

<ロ> <四> <四> <四> <四> <四</p>

### npregress Standard Errors

#### https://www.stata.com/manuals/rnpregress.pdf

npregress kernel y x i.a, vce(bootstrap, reps(1000) seed(111))

npregress kernel y x i.a, reps(1000) seed(111)

# npregress Standard Errors

#### https://www.stata.com/manuals/rnpregress.pdf

npregress kernel y x i.a, vce(bootstrap, reps(1000) seed(111))

npregress kernel y x i.a, reps(1000) seed(111)

(StataCorp LLC)

▲ ▲ 볼 ▶ 볼 ∽ ි May 09, 2018 43 / 69

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 >

### npregress Standard Errors

#### https://www.stata.com/manuals/rnpregress.pdf

npregress kernel y x i.a, vce(bootstrap, reps(1000) seed(111))

npregress kernel y x i.a, reps(1000) seed(111)

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

#### npregress Confidence Intervals

. npregress kernel lbweight mage medu i.msmoke i.alcohol, reps(1000) seed(111) (running npregress on estimation sample) Bootstrap replications (1000) (output omitted) Bandwidth

|   | Mean   | Effect                                       |                                    |                |                          |                      |
|---|--|--|------------------------------------|----------------|--------------------------|----------------------|
| mage<br>medu<br>msmoke<br>alcohol   | 3.149233<br>1.092557<br>.4397903<br>.0369884 | 36.95622<br>12.82115<br>.4397903<br>.0369884 |                                    |                |                          |                      |
| Local-linear regression<br>Continuous kernel : epanechnikov<br>Discrete kernel : liracine<br>Bandwidth : cross validation |  | Numi<br>E (Ko<br>R-s)                        | ber of obs<br>ernel obs)<br>quared | =<br>=         | 1,000<br>1,000<br>0.4215 |                      |
| lbweight  | Observed<br>Estimate                         | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err.                       | Z                                  | ₽> z           | Perce<br>[95% Conf.      | ntile<br>Interval]   |
| Mean<br>lbweight  | .0964155                                     | .0092934                                     | 10.37                              | 0.000          | .0784985                 | .1146061             |
| Effect<br>mage<br>medu<br>msmoke  | 002998<br>023344                             | .0012575<br>.0033661                         | -2.38<br>-6.94                     | 0.017<br>0.000 | 0055092<br>0298985       | 0006704<br>0167461   |
| (1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 0)   | .0969135<br>.2136147                         | .0110657<br>.0243908                         | 8.76<br>8.76                       | 0.000<br>0.000 | .0758351<br>.1621227     | .1183473<br>.2603727 |
| alcohol<br>(yes vs no)  | .2147543                                     | .0219014                                     | 9.81                               | 0.000          | .1712824                 | .2571516             |

Note: Effect estimates are averages of derivatives for continuous covariates and averages of contrasts for factor covariates.

# Inference

(StataCorp LLC)

■ ▶ ▲ ■ ▶ ■ 夕々の May 09, 2018 45 / 69

- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight?
- Average of the mean function (conditional probability)

4 A N

- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight?
- Average of the mean function (conditional probability)

#### • margins

Note: You may compute standard errors using vce(bootstrap) or reps().

<ロ> <四> <四> <四> <四> <四</p>

#### • margins

| . margins<br>Predictive ma<br>Expression | rgins<br>: mean function, predict() | Number of obs | = | 1,000 |
|--|-------------------------------------|---------------|---|-------|
|  | Margin                              |               |   |       |
| cons                                     | .0964155                            |               |   |       |
|  |                                     |               |   |       |

Note: You may compute standard errors using vce(bootstrap) or reps().

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

| . margins, re<br>(running margi<br>Bootstrap repl | eps(1000) seed<br>ins on estimat<br>lications (100 | d(111)<br>tion sample)<br>D0) |       |         |        |        |           |
|---|--|-------------------------------|-------|---------|--------|--------|-----------|
| (output omitte                                    | ed)  |                               |       |         |        |        |           |
| Predictive man                                    | rgins  |                               |       | Number  | of obs | =      | 1,000     |
|   |  |                               |       | Replica | tions  | =      | 1,000     |
| Expression :                                      | mean function                                      | on, predict()                 |       |         |        |        |           |
|   | Observed   | Bootstrap                     |       |         |        | Percei | ntile     |
|   | Margin   | Std. Err.                     | Z     | P> z    | [95%   | Conf.  | Interval] |
| _cons   | .0964155   | .0092934                      | 10.37 | 0.000   | .078   | 4985   | .1146061  |

◆□> ◆□> ◆注> ◆注> □注

# • What is the population-average probability of low birthweight evaluated at different values of msmoke

- What is the population—average probability of low birthweight for different levels of the treatment msmoke
- Counterfactual

- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight evaluated at different values of msmoke
- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight for different levels of the treatment msmoke
- Counterfactual

- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight evaluated at different values of msmoke
- What is the population-average probability of low birthweight for different levels of the treatment msmoke
- Counterfactual

# Probabilities at Different Values of msmoke

| . margins msm<br>(running margi<br>Bootstrap repl<br>(output omitte | noke, reps(100<br>ins on estimat<br>lications (100<br>ed) | 00) seed(111)<br>tion sample)<br>00) |                        |                         |                        |                      | 1 000                          |
|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|
| Predictive mai  | rgins   |                                      |                        | Replicat                | tions                  | =                    | 1,000                          |
| Expression  | mean functio  | on, predict()                        |                        | Repried                 |                        |                      | 1,000                          |
|   | Observed<br>Margin  | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err.               | z                      | ₽> z                    | [95%                   | Percer<br>Conf.      | ntile<br>Interval]             |
| msmoke<br>0<br>1-5<br>6+  | .0220855<br>.1189991<br>.2357003                          | .0074394<br>.0110734<br>.0224171     | 2.97<br>10.75<br>10.51 | 0.003<br>0.000<br>0.000 | .0083<br>.098<br>.1913 | 1794<br>6169<br>3104 | .0377342<br>.140994<br>.276417 |

э

#### • What is the average treatment effect of smoking

• The population—average of the difference of mean function estimates at each level with respect to the base level

- What is the average treatment effect of smoking
- The population-average of the difference of mean function estimates at each level with respect to the base level

#### **Treatment Effects**

. margins r.msmoke, contrast(nowald) reps(1000) seed(111) (running margins on estimation sample) Bootstrap replications (1000) (output omitted) Contrasts of predictive margins

Number of obs = 1,000 Replications = 1,000

Expression : mean function, predict()

|                                   | Observed             | Bootstrap | Perce                | ntile                |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|-----------|----------------------|----------------------|
|                                   | Contrast             | Std. Err. | [95% Conf.           | Interval]            |
| msmoke<br>(1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 0) | .0969135<br>.2136147 | .0110657  | .0758351<br>.1621227 | .1183473<br>.2603727 |

xpression : mean function, predict()

3

#### **Treatment Effects**

. margins r.msmoke, contrast(nowald) reps(1000) seed(111) (running margins on estimation sample) Bootstrap replications (1000) (output omitted) Contrasts of predictive margins

Number of obs = 1,000 Replications = 1,000

Expression : mean function, predict()

|                                   | Observed             | Bootstrap            | Perce                | ntile                |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
|                                   | Contrast             | Std. Err.            | [95% Conf.           | Interval]            |
| msmoke<br>(1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 0) | .0969135<br>.2136147 | .0110657<br>.0243908 | .0758351<br>.1621227 | .1183473<br>.2603727 |

Expression : mean function, predict()

|                          | Observed<br>Margin               | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err.           | Z                      | ₽>   z                  | Perce<br>[95% Conf.              | entile<br>Interval]            |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| msmoke<br>0<br>1-5<br>6+ | .0220855<br>.1189991<br>.2357003 | .0074394<br>.0110734<br>.0224171 | 2.97<br>10.75<br>10.51 | 0.003<br>0.000<br>0.000 | .0081794<br>.0986169<br>.1913104 | .0377342<br>.140994<br>.276417 |

May 09, 2018

52/69

- What would the effects be if I compared them to adjacent levels instead of the base level.
- Incremental effect

- What would the effects be if I compared them to adjacent levels instead of the base level.
- Incremental effect

. margins ar.msmoke, contrast(nowald) reps(1000) seed(111) (running margins on estimation sample) Bootstrap replications (1000) (output omitted) Contrasts of predictive margins

| Expression                          | : mean functio       | on, predict()          | Numb<br>Repl         | er of obs<br>ications | = | 1,000<br>1,000 |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|---|----------------|
|                                     | Observed<br>Contrast | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err. | Perce<br>[95% Conf.  | ntile<br>Interval]    |   |                |
| msmoke<br>(1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 1-5) | .0969135             | .0110657               | .0758351<br>.0815164 | .1183473              |   |                |

 What would the population-averaged probability of low birthweight be if all mothers in the population increased their education by 4 years.

4 **A b b b b b b** 

## **Counterfactual Education Levels**

| <pre>. margins, at(medu=generate(medu)) at(medu=generate(medu+4) &gt; reps(1000) seed(111) (running margins on estimation sample) Bootstrap replications (1000) (output omitted) Predictive margins Number of ok Benlications</pre> |                                    |                                     |               |         | du+4))<br>of obs | /              | 1,000              |
|---|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------|---------|------------------|----------------|--------------------|
| Expression<br>1at<br>2at  | : mean functio<br>: medu<br>: medu | on, predict()<br>= medu<br>= medu+4 | 1             | Repireu | 10115            |                | 1,000              |
|   | Observed<br>Margin                 | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err.              | Z             | ₽> z    | [95%             | Perce<br>Conf. | ntile<br>Interval] |
| at<br>1<br>2  | .0964155<br>.0321729               | .0092934<br>.0114623                | 10.37<br>2.81 | 0.000   | .0784            | 4985<br>0669   | .1146061           |

(I) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1)) < ((1))

# Contrasting

```
. margins, at (medu=generate (medu)) at (medu=generate (medu+4)) ///
<
                  contrast(at(r)) reps(1000) seed(111)
(running margins on estimation sample)
Bootstrap replications (1000)
(output omitted)
Contrasts of predictive margins
                                                Number of obs
                                                                         1,000
                                                Replications
                                                                         1,000
                                                                  =
Expression
             : mean function, predict()
1._at
             : medu
                               = medu
2. at
             : medu
                               = medu+4
                                           Percentile
                 Observed
                            Bootstrap
                           Std. Err.
                                          [95% Conf. Interval]
                 Contrast
        at
   (2 vs 1)
                -.0642426
                          .0121771
                                         -.0856404
                                                    -.0376858
```

- What is the population-average of low birthweight for each counterfactual level of msmoke if everyone in the population received a different level of education
- population-average of low birthweight for fixed level of msmoke and medu

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

- What is the population-average of low birthweight for each counterfactual level of msmoke if everyone in the population received a different level of education
- population-average of low birthweight for fixed level of msmoke and medu

### **Counterfactual Education Level**

- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15))
- marginsplot, recastci(rarea) ciopts(fcolor(%50))

A (10) A (10) A (10)


イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

#### Interpretation of Confidence Bands and contrast

- Overlapping confidence intervals do not mean there is no difference between (0 and 1-5)
- Confidence intervals are for the point estimates not the difference
- The way to test this is testing for the differences, the effects.

#### Interpretation of Confidence Bands and contrast

- Overlapping confidence intervals do not mean there is no difference between (0 and 1-5)
- Confidence intervals are for the point estimates not the difference
- The way to test this is testing for the differences, the effects.

#### 0 vs 1-5

margins  $r(0 \ 1)$ .msmoke , at(medu=(6(1)15))



イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

#### 1-5 vs 6+

margins  $r(1 \ 2)$ .msmoke , at(medu=(6(1)15))



イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

#### **Continue Exploring Function**

#### • margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15))

• margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=0
 mage=(16(1)34)) at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=1
 mage=(16(1)34))

#### **Continue Exploring Function**

- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15))
- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=0) at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=1)
- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=0
  mage=(16(1)34)) at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=1
  mage=(16(1)34))

#### **Continue Exploring Function**

- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15))
- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=0) at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=1)
- margins msmoke, at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=0
  mage=(16(1)34)) at(medu=(6(1)15) alcohol=1
  mage=(16(1)34))

# Parting Words

(StataCorp LLC)

■ ▶ ◀ ■ ▶ ■ 夕 � ♂ May 09, 2018 65 / 69

イロト イポト イヨト イヨ

#### If you have a lot of data per covariate

- Data per region is important (identification)
- Time consuming
- Benefits

A (10) > A (10) > A (10)

- If you have a lot of data per covariate
- Data per region is important (identification)
- Time consuming
- Benefits

A (1) > A (1) > A

- If you have a lot of data per covariate
- Data per region is important (identification)
- Time consuming
- Benefits

A .

- If you have a lot of data per covariate
- Data per region is important (identification)
- Time consuming
- Benefits

A .

## margins After Correctly Specified Functional Form

#### probit lbweight c.mage#c.mage c.medu##c.mage i.msmoke##i.alcohol

Note: dy/dx for factor levels is the discrete change from the base level.

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 >

#### margins After Correctly Specified Functional Form

probit lbweight c.mage#c.mage c.medu##c.mage i.msmoke##i.alcohol

| . margins, c  | ydx(*)                           |               |   |       |
|---------------|----------------------------------|---------------|---|-------|
| Average margi | nal effects                      | Number of obs | = | 1,000 |
| Model VCE     | : OIM                            |               |   |       |
| Expression    | : Pr(lbweight), predict()        |               |   |       |
| dy/dx w.r.t.  | : mage medu 1.msmoke 2.msmoke 1. | alcohol       |   |       |

|                     | dy/dx               | Delta-method<br>Std. Err. | Z              | P>∣z∣ | [95% Conf.           | Interval]            |
|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------------|----------------|-------|----------------------|----------------------|
| mage<br>medu        | 0030745<br>025059   | .0012678                  | -2.43<br>-7.07 | 0.015 | 0055593<br>0320069   | 0005898<br>0181112   |
| msmoke<br>1-5<br>6+ | .088816<br>.2155829 | .0146566                  | 6.06<br>8.90   | 0.000 | .0600897<br>.1681125 | .1175424<br>.2630533 |
| alcohol<br>yes      | .2103893            | .0198121                  | 10.62          | 0.000 | .1715584             | .2492203             |

Note: dy/dx for factor levels is the discrete change from the base level.

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

#### npregress

| lbweight                          | Observed<br>Estimate | Bootstrap<br>Std. Err. | Z              | P> z  | Perce<br>[95% Conf.  | entile<br>Interval]  |
|-----------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|----------------|-------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Mean<br>lbweight                  | .0964155             | .0101926               | 9.46           | 0.000 | .0754131             | .1146312             |
| Effect<br>mage<br>medu            | 002998<br>023344     | .001135<br>.003595     | -2.64<br>-6.49 | 0.008 | 0047728<br>030541    | 0007828<br>0164684   |
| msmoke<br>(1-5 vs 0)<br>(6+ vs 0) | .0969135<br>.2136147 | .0125798<br>.0255175   | 7.70<br>8.37   | 0.000 | .0660747<br>.1568306 | .1185829<br>.2565002 |
| alcohol<br>(yes vs no)            | .2147543             | .021038                | 10.21          | 0.000 | .1752073             | .2571517             |

. npregress

Note: Effect estimates are averages of derivatives for continuous covariates and averages of contrasts for factor covariates.

<ロ> <四> <四> <四> <四> <四</p>

- Obtain understanding and intuition about nonparametric regression
- Think about nonparametric regression as a tool to make inferences about the mean function
  - npregress as a tool to obtain the mean function, effects, and average derivatives
  - margins as a tool to explore the mean function and ask interesting questions
- Unique to Stata

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

- Obtain understanding and intuition about nonparametric regression
- Think about nonparametric regression as a tool to make inferences about the mean function
  - npregress as a tool to obtain the mean function, effects, and average derivatives
  - margins as a tool to explore the mean function and ask interesting questions
- Unique to Stata

< 回 > < 三 > < 三 >

- Obtain understanding and intuition about nonparametric regression
- Think about nonparametric regression as a tool to make inferences about the mean function
  - npregress as a tool to obtain the mean function, effects, and average derivatives
  - margins as a tool to explore the mean function and ask interesting questions
- Unique to Stata

< 回 > < 回 > < 回 >

- Obtain understanding and intuition about nonparametric regression
- Think about nonparametric regression as a tool to make inferences about the mean function
  - npregress as a tool to obtain the mean function, effects, and average derivatives
  - margins as a tool to explore the mean function and ask interesting questions
- Unique to Stata

A D A D A D A