

VACCINATION COVERAGE QUALITY INDICATORS (VCQI)

dale A. Rhoda¹, Mary Kay Trimner¹, Mary L. Prier¹, Caitlin B. Clary¹ felicity T. cutts², M. carolina danovaro-holliday³

¹ BIOSTAT GLOBAL CONSULTING ²LONDON SCHOOL OF HYGIENE AND TROPICAL MEDICINE ³ WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION A Flexible Collection of Stata Programs for Standardized Survey Data Analysis

ale.Rhoda@biostatglobal.cor

VCQI WAS DEVELOPED WITH SUPPORT FROM:

World Health Organization Pan-American Health Organization GAVI – The Vaccine Alliance Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

We thank them for their partnership & collaboration! Opinions expressed today are those of the presenter...not of these organizations.

CONTEXT

Vaccination is one of the most effective public health interventions known to mankind

In low- and middle-income countries, administrative systems do an imperfect job quantifying <u>vaccination</u> <u>coverage</u> (the % of eligible children who receive each vaccine)

NOLEVEL MANAGERS

(B) and and

LO HEALTH ORGANIZATION TION COVERAGE CLUSTER YS, REFERENCE MANUAL

So, household surveys are conducted periodically to furnish independent coverage estimates

The World Health Organization (WHO) has provided resources on how to design, conduct, and analyze these surveys since the 1970s

We helped update their reference manual in 2018

3

VACCINATION COVERAGE SURVEYS

Use a multi-stage stratified cluster design with rigorously random selection

Target population is often children 12-23m old

Interviewer asks the child's caregiver some demographic questions & to see home-based record (HBR) of vaccinations (aka card)

Records the doses and dates from card; if no card present, records data from caregiver recall

Sometimes visits the nearby health center to obtain documented evidence from facilitybased record (FBR) if HBR is not available



VACCINATION COVERAGE SURVEYS

Conducted as part of large standardized multi-topic surveys

Demographic and Health Surveys (USAID)

Multi-Indicator Cluster Surveys (UNICEF)

Also conducted by country-led teams • WHO Expanded Programme on Immunization (EPI)



VACCINATION COVERAGE SURVEYS

Always report: • % with card

- % vaccinated according to card, recall, and card or recall
- % fully-vaccinated
- % not vaccinated at all (so-called zero-dose kids)
- Drop-out
 (% of children who start but do not finish a series)

If % with card is high, can report informative indicators that use the dates from cards

- Timeliness of vaccination
- Whether doses were administered at the earliest opportunity or no



ISSUES ADDRESSED BY



Surveys vary in numerous details

No recognized standard for how to name & code variables or how to calculate indicators – practices differ somewhat

Writing specialized analysis code for a single survey is resource-intensive and error-prone

Most surveys collect dates from HBR/FBR, but do not report date-based outcomes

Most surveys do not report coverage confidence intervals

The big standardized surveys share their data their and stratum-level outcomes, but not the derived variables at the respondent level or the code used to calculate outcomes

The following slide lists some ways that countries / surveys / analyses can vary – VCQI handles logical combinations of these factors.

Country vaccination schedule

- Doses required to be fully-vaccinated
- Scheduled interval between series doses: is it equal to or is it greater than the minimum interval between valid doses

SURVEY FEATURES THAT **REQUIRE FLEXIBILITY IN** ANALYSIS

- Type of sampling (cluster, simple random, etc.)
- Vaccination evidence sought from card or recall or register
- Evidence sought from BCG scar
- SIA evidence from finger mark
- Ages of eligible respondents
- Names of geographic strata (nested up to 3 levels deep)
- [•] Demographic stratifiers (urban/rural, male/female, etc.)
- Order of strata in tables and figures
- List of doses in the analysis & their order in tables
- Should boosters be shifted down to count as primary doses
- Which indicators to calculate
- Weighted analysis or no
- Type of confidence interval
- Table titles & footnotes
- Language for text in tables and figures* (i.e., English, French, Spanish, Russian, Arabic, etc.)

* Not yet implemented in VCQI, but planned for future upgrade





Our approach with VCQI is to document everything so our work would be transparent and reproducible. The indicators themselves are defined in the 'Working list of Vx Survey Analyses' an din the 'Results Interpretation Guide'. The software specifications to calculate them are in the specifications document. And the codebook for how to name and code variables to be compatible with VCQI are in the 'Forms and Variables List (FVL)' document. Finally, how to run VCQI is documented in the 'Getting Started' guide and 'User's Guide'.



VCQI HANDLES

Survey from a single geographic stratum

Survey from several strata (Burkina Faso had 63)

Up to 3 nested geographic levels plus demographic sub-groups, so, 4 levels overall



	Protected at birth (%)	95% CI (%)	95% LCB (%)	95% UCB (%)	DEFF	ICC	N	Weighted
Harmonia	81.5	(79.9, 83.0)	80.1	82.8	1.3	0.0054	3,064	6,417,2
Southern Province	81.8	(79.6, 83.8)	80.0	83.5	1.1	0.0135	1,493	3,044,1
District 01	82.1	(77.8, 85.7)	78.6	85.1	0.8	-0.0262	308	1,028,4
District 02	82.2	(75.9, 87.1)	77.1	86.4	1.6	0.0729	310	284,9
District 03	81.6	(74.4, 87.1)	75.7	86.3	1.8	0.0762	285	611,8
District 04	81.1	(76.8, 84.7)	77.5	84.2	0.7	-0.0278	269	530,3
District 05	82.2	(77.8, 85.9)	78.6	85.3	0.9	-0.0147	321	588,4
Northern Province	81.2	(78.7, 83.4)	79.2	83.1	1.4	-0.0022	1,571	3,373,1
District 06	83.7	(78.3, 88.0)	79.3	87.3	1.2	0.0110	301	223,1
District 07	84.0	(80.5, 86.9)	81.1	86.5	0.5	-0.0604	292	870,6
District 08	77.5	(72.0, 82.1)	73.0	81.4	1.1	0.0063	305	1,330,0
District 09	81.9	(76.9, 85.9)	77.8	85.3	1.1	0.0283	336	622,2
District 10	85.8	(82.2, 88.8)	82.8	88.3	0.7	-0.0272	337	327,0

Here is a sample table showing three levels of nested geographic results. Districts are nested within provinces which are nested within the country. VCQI gives the user flexibility for how to define the rows (strata) but not much flexibility about what is reported in the table columns. If the user wants flexibility in the columns, s/he would need to either change the VCQI code, or make use of the output 'databases' or flat files that document stratum level results and may be easily manipulated by downstream code or tools.



Here's an example of a VCQI figure that summarizes vaccination coverage and timeliness for a single stratum.



The augmented dataset might serve as the start for advanced analyses, like logistic regression. The outcome variable might be one of VCQI's derived variables like whether the child is fully vaccinated. The independent variables could include demographic predictors and other covariates from the survey dataset, or merged in with the survey dataset. Alternatively, the user may wish to view VCQI output in an interactive tool, or make tables and figures using tools their team is skilled at using.



The Stata maps on the left side of the slide were made with Maurizio Pisati's wonderful program: spmap. The map of kenya provinces at upper right was made in Excel by John Wagai. The Tableau figure at bottom right was intended to give an *infographic* feeling, and was made by Wenfeng Gong.

Missed	Opportunit	ies for Vaco	cination							VC	Q	Webciegto Compage QAALIN WEICATOR
					Crude/Valid		Grouping Level					
					crude	<u>.</u>	Level 2	6 5 ()				
Getting Started	MOV Occurrence	Time to Correction										
sta from Nigeria. (Displaying crude measures	of MOV.										
	BCG	DPT1	DPT2	OPT3	MCVI	OPVI	OPV2	OF	NM NM	AC	sc	NC
Nigeria 1998	204	E 164	135	102	[2]	155	122		357	27.1	18.1	18.0
Nigeria 2003	221	SH	672		165	154	510		A 40.2	21.0	12.1	22.8
Nigeria 2008	1127	665	265	729	275	887	247.		40.8	34.8	19.1	15.1
Nigeria 2013	1982	1298	1168	1064	1055	51185	[1106]		427	42.8	7.1	8.3
			Vecchaled At Fin	rf Eligible Opportunity	MON - Later Corrected	MOV - Uncorrected				nny dy Statum arright (d) * s		

This slide shows an R shiny app that is available for VCQI analyses to explore missed opportunities for simultaneous vaccination. (See Rhoda et al, 2021)

Block	Control Program Outline	User Edits?
А	Initialize Stata – clean out old data, programs, and macros	No
В	List input and output folders & name for this analysis	Yes
С	Open the log file & document VCQI program versions	No
D	List datasets & metadata re: schedule, survey & analysis	Yes
Е	VCQI checks inputs; pre-process analysis dataset	No
F	List which indicators to calculate & specify inputs	Yes
G	VCQI closes log, deletes temp files, informs re: errors	No
		17

Typically the users fixes most of the parameters in Block D once and then makes minor variations in Blocks B and F to do several runs. Edit; Save As; Run; Edit; Save As; Run; repeat as necessary

15	l vcqi_scalar bcg_min_age_days = 0 // birth dose
15	<pre>2 vcqi_scalar hepb_min_age_days = 0 // birth dose</pre>
15	3 vcqi_scalar opv0_min_age_days = 0 // birth dose
. 15	
15	8 * Note: In this country, opv0 and hepb0 are only considered valid
	5 * if given in the first two weeks of life
SPECIFY 15	<pre>7 vcqi_scalar_opv0_max_age_days = 14 // birth dose</pre>
15	3 vcqi_scalar hepb_max_age_days = 14 // birth dose
	<pre>vcqi_scalar penta1_min_age_days = 42 // 6 weeks</pre>
16	l vcqi_scalar penta2_min_age_days = 70 // 10 weeks
	2 vcqi_scalar penta2_min_interval_days = 28 // 4 weeks
	<pre>3 vcqi_scalar pcv1_min_age_days = 42 // 6 weeks</pre>
	<pre>vcqi_scalar opv1_min_age_days = 42 // 6 weeks</pre>
16	5 vcqi_scalar rota1_min_age_days = 42 // 6 weeks
	5
(BLOCK D)	
16	
16	
17	
17	
17	
17	
17-	
17	
17	
17	
17	
17	
18	
18	
18	
18	
18	
18	
18	5 vcqi_scalar yf_min_age_days = 270 // 9 months 18

Here is some code from Block D that describes the vaccination schedule in the fictitious country of Harmonia. The program 'vcqi_scalar' sets a Stata scalar and documents it in the VCQI log.



This slide shows more code from Block D...these lines are setting the values of parameters that describe the survey...earliest and latest dates that a child eligible for this survey might have been vaccinated. Ages of eligibility...and a parameter to describe whether the survey team sought vaccination evidence from FBRs.

space sp
--

These lines are setting options for what sort of output to produce, or save, or delete in this VCQI run.

24	*
25	* Calculate issues with continuity (dropout) for three dose pairs:
26 27 28	 * 1. Dropout from Penta1 to Penta3 * 2. Dropout from OPV1 to OPV3 * 3. Dropout from Penta3 to MCV1
29 30 31	vcqi_global RI_CONT_01_DROPOUT_LIST PENTA1 PENTA3 OPV1 OPV3 PENTA3 MCV1
32	vcqi_global RI_CONT_01_T0_TITLE Dropout
33	vcqi_global RI_CONT_01_T0_SUBTITLE
34	<pre>vcqi_global RI_CONT_01_T0_FOOTNOTE_1 Note: This measure is an unweighted summary of a proportion from the survey sample.</pre>
35	vcqi_global SORT_PLOT_LOW_T0_HIGH 0 // 1 means show strata w/ low outcomes at bottom and high at top
36	
37 38	RI_CONT_01

Here is some code from Block D to calculate vaccination dropout "RI_CONT_01" stands for "routine immunization continuity indicator 01". That .ado file is shown on the next slide.



RI_CONT_01 calls five more VCQI .ado files, in turn.



Inchworm plots Visual Representation of Inferential Uncertainty (Stata Conference 2016)

Organ pipe plots Visualize Disparities in Cluster-Level Coverage (Stata Conference 2018)



We've presented in earlier Stata conferences on portions of VCQI code that might be useful to analysts outside the world of vaccination surveys.



We have <u>not</u> yet shared this helpful .ado file with the world...it is part of VCQI but we haven't featured its useful properties. If you want to maybe use svypd.ado, contact me.

RECEPTION / ADOPTION

Survey data analysis is a specialized field

Vaccination coverage survey analysis is doubly-specialized

We have trained analysts in workshops around the world

Several coverage survey consultants use VCQI

International funders & partners are starting to ask for VCQI involvement in important surveys

No one outside our company has added code to VCQI

We get involved in any complicated applications

There is a desire to build more global capacity, but only a handful of people analyze several such surveys per year

A "centers of excellence" model has been proposed, but not taken up yet



PAIN POINTS

Intermittent funding support

* Stable ongoing funding would facilitate long-term plans & capacity building

Programmatic partners' learning curves

- Don't know that they should ask for a *full analysis* with indicators beyond the basics
- Need training to interpret indicators & use the output & identify what is important

Software

- Not vectorized or even by: compatible. VCQI runs a LOT of nested loops...so is slow for runs with many strata and respondents and indicators
- Still compatible with Stata v14 (for WHO licensing budget reasons) so Excel formatting fails for large runs – need to break up the jobs or format tables by hand



We have lots of ideas for making VCQI more efficient and using capabilities of newer versions of Stata. We also receive queries about porting VCQI to R because of perceptions that our target users might be more likely to receive R training than Stata training at universities around the world, and the idea that the Stata license fee may be a barrier to participation for some would-be VCQI analysts.

SUMMARY

VCQI is a free, flexible, and powerful global resource that instantiates a vision for transparent, documented, reproducible analysis of vaccination coverage household surveys

It is used to analyze many of the most important coverage surveys conducted today (i.e., in countries where polio is still endemic)

It provides a lot of specialized capability and yet only requires users to interact with a single .do file, which exists in template form

Several people use it productively – a few use it proficiently

(It could serve as a rich resource for master's degree students around the world who want to do secondary analyses of publicly available datasets, like Demographic & Health Surveys from USAID or Multi-Indicator Cluster Surveys (MICS) from UNICEF.)

VCQI's long-term prospects for maintenance and expanded user base will depend on vision and resources from funding partners

LEARN MORE

VCQI Documentation, Programs, Example Datasets

WHO Cluster Survey Reference Manual 2018

2016 Inchworm Plot Stata Conference Talk

2018 Organ Pipe Plot Stata Conference Talk

Implementing WHO guidance on conducting and analysing vaccination coverage cluster surveys: Two examples from Nigeria Wagai et al, 2020 in *PLOS ONE*

Using Household Surveys to Assess Missed Opportunities for Simultaneous Vaccination: Longitudinal Examples from Colombia and Nigeria Rhoda et al., 2021 in *Vaccines*

Evaluating Confidence Interval Methods for Binomial Proportions in Clustered Surveys Dean & Pagano 2015 in *JSSAM*

Harmonizing vaccination coverage measures in household surveys: A primer

www.biostatglobal.com/vcqi_resources.html https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/272820 https://www.stata.com/meeting/chicago16/ https://www.stata.com/meeting/columbus18/

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0247415

https://doi.org/10.3390/vaccines9070795

https://doi.org/10.1093/jssam/smv024

http://bit.ly/3IGF9U5



Following the Stata Conference 2021 example of two of my bearded heroes, Nick Cox and Billy Buchanan, I'm closing with quotes from two of my other bearded heroes: Martin Fowler and Jim Henson.



INDICATORS IN VCQI TODAY

Routine immunization (20+) Tetanus protection at birth (1) Post-campaign coverage (6) Dataset description (3) Hypothesis test for coverage differences (2)

Good ideas for new indicators come up every year...



USER SELECTS INCHWORMS OR BAR CHARTS









USER SELECTS: SORT BY OUTCOME OR SAME ORDER AS TABLES







Analysis of survey data should be done by a statistician – or under the guidance of a statistician

TARGET USER

User does not need to be an advanced Stata programmer... but must be comfortable modifying & running a .do-file according to a template & User's Guide