## Description

To illustrate crossed models, we use


Sorted by: pid sid
. notes
_dta:

1. Paterson, L. 1991. "Socio-economic status and education attainment: A multidimensional and multilevel study" in _Evaluation and Research in Education_ 5: 97-121.
2. Each observation is a different student. Each student attended a primary school (pid) and a secondary school (sid).
3. pid and sid are crossed, not nested. All combinations are possible.

Rabe-Hesketh and Skrondal (2022, 493-512) give an introduction to crossed-effects models and provide other examples of crossed-effects models by using the school data from Fife, Scotland.

See Structural models 1: Linear regression and Multilevel mixed-effects models in [SEM] Intro 5 for background.

## Remarks and examples

Remarks are presented under the following headings:
The crossed model
Fitting the model with the Builder

## The crossed model

In these data, 3,435 students attended 148 different primary schools and 19 different secondary schools. The model we wish to fit is


We include latent (random) effects for primary and secondary school because we think that school identities may have an effect.

The command syntax to fit this model is

```
. gsem (attain <- i.sex M1[pid] M2[sid])
note: crossed random-effects model specified; option intmethod(laplace)
    implied.
Fitting fixed-effects model:
Iteration 0: Log likelihood \(=-8701.1372\)
Iteration 1: Log likelihood = -8701.1372
Refining starting values:
Grid node 0: Log likelihood \(=-8587.4875\)
Fitting full model:
Iteration 0: Log likelihood \(=-8587.4875\)
Iteration 1: Log likelihood \(=-8573.5619\)
Iteration 2: Log likelihood \(=-8563.0123\)
Iteration 3: Log likelihood \(=-8561.7426\)
Iteration 4: Log likelihood \(=-8561.7354\)
Iteration 5: Log likelihood \(=-8561.7354\)
Generalized structural equation model Number of obs \(=3,435\)
Response: attain
Family: Gaussian
Link: Identity
Log likelihood = -8561.7354
    ( 1) [attain]M2[sid] = 1
    ( 2) [attain]M1[pid] = 1
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline & Coefficient & Std. err. & z & \(P>|z|\) & \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{[95\% conf. interval]} \\
\hline \multicolumn{7}{|l|}{attain} \\
\hline 1.sex & . 4986152 & . 0982634 & 5.07 & 0.000 & . 3060224 & . 6912079 \\
\hline M1 [pid] & 1 & (constrain & & & & \\
\hline M2 [sid] & 1 & (constrain & & & & \\
\hline _cons & 5.257372 & . 1813785 & 28.99 & 0.000 & 4.901876 & 5.612867 \\
\hline \(\operatorname{var}(\mathrm{M1}[\mathrm{pid}])\) & 1.104316 & . 2022595 & & & . 7712452 & 1.581226 \\
\hline \(\operatorname{var}(\mathrm{M} 2[s i d])\) & . 3457089 & . 160868 & & & . 1388746 & . 8605941 \\
\hline var(e.attain) & 8.053437 & . 1990023 & & & 7.672694 & 8.453074 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
```


## Notes:

1. These data are not nested, but the diagram above would look the same even if they were. The fact that primary and secondary schools are crossed and not nested is, however, specified when we enter the model into the SEM Builder and is implicit in the command syntax.
2. We typed attain <- i.sex M1[pid] M2[sid]. We would have typed attain <- i.sex M1 [pid] M2 [sid<pid] had secondary school been nested within primary school.
3. gsem produced the following note when it began estimation: "crossed random effects detected; option intmethod(laplace) assumed". gsem provides four integration methods. The default is mvaghermite, which stands for mean-variance adaptive Gauss-Hermite quadrature. The others are mcaghermite (mode-curvature adaptive Gauss-Hermite quadrature); ghermite (nonadaptive Gauss-Hermite quadrature); and laplace (Laplacian approximation).
In general, the adaptive methods mvaghermite and mcaghermite are considered superior in terms of accuracy to the nonadaptive method ghermite, which is considered superior to the approximation method laplace. They also take longer.

Fitting crossed models can be difficult. You may specify intmethod() with one of the superior methods, but be aware, convergence may not be achieved in finite time.

## Fitting the model with the Builder

Use the diagram in The crossed model above for reference.

1. Open the dataset.

In the Command window, type
. use https://www.stata-press.com/data/r18/gsem_fifeschool
2. Open a new Builder diagram.

Select menu item Statistics $>$ SEM (structural equation modeling) $>$ Model building and estimation.
3. Put the Builder in gsem mode by clicking on the ${ }^{\text {sen }}$ button.
4. Create the endogenous variable.
a. Select the Add observed variable tool, $\square$, and then click in the diagram about one-third of the way in from the right and halfway down from the top. After adding it, you can click inside the rectangle and move the variable if you wish.
b. In the Contextual Toolbar, select attain with the Variable control.
5. Create the observed exogenous variable.
a. Select the Add observed variable tool, $\square$, and then click in the diagram about one-third of the way in from the left and halfway down from the top.
b. In the Contextual Toolbar, type 1. sex in the Variable control (typing 1.sex rather than using the ${ }^{*-}$ button to create i.sex prevents the rectangle corresponding to the base category for this binary variable from being created);
6. Create the pid-level latent variable.
a. Select the Add multilevel latent variable tool, ${ }^{\circ}$, and click below the rectangle for attain.
b. In the Contextual Toolbar, click on the ${ }^{-7}$ button.
c. Select the nesting level and nesting variable by selecting 2 from the Nesting depth control and selecting pid $>$ Observations in the next control.
d. Specify M1 as the Base name.
e. Click on OK.
7. Create the sid-level latent variable.
a. Select the Add multilevel latent variable tool, ${ }^{\circ}$, and click above the rectangle for attain.
b. In the Contextual Toolbar, click on the ${ }^{-\cdots}$ button.
c. Select the nesting level and nesting variable by selecting 2 from the Nesting depth control and selecting sid $>$ Observations in the next control.
d. Specify M2 as the Base name.
e. Click on OK.
8. Create the paths from the exogenous variables to attain.
a. Select the Add path tool, $\rightarrow$.
b. Click in the right side of the 1 . sex rectangle (it will highlight when you hover over it), and drag a path to the left side of the attain rectangle (it will highlight when you can release to connect the path).
c. Continuing with the $\rightarrow$ tool, draw paths from bottom of the sid $_{2}$ double oval to the top of the attain rectangle and from the top of the $\mathrm{pid}_{1}$ double oval to the bottom of the attain rectangle.
9. Clean up the location of the paths.

If you do not like where the paths have been connected to the rectangles or oval, use the Select tool, $\uparrow$, to click on the path, and then simply click on where it connects to a rectangle or oval and drag the endpoint.
10. Estimate.

Click on the Estimate button, in the Standard Toolbar, and then click on OK in the resulting GSEM estimation options dialog box.

You can open a completed diagram in the Builder by typing
. webgetsem gsem_cross

## Reference

Rabe-Hesketh, S., and A. Skrondal. 2022. Multilevel and Longitudinal Modeling Using Stata. 4th ed. College Station, TX: Stata Press.

## Also see

[SEM] Example 38g - Random-intercept and random-slope models (multilevel)
[SEM] Intro 5 - Tour of models
[SEM] gsem - Generalized structural equation model estimation command

[^0]


[^0]:    Stata, Stata Press, and Mata are registered trademarks of StataCorp LLC. Stata and Stata Press are registered trademarks with the World Intellectual Property Organization of the United Nations. Other brand and product names are registered trademarks or trademarks of their respective companies. Copyright (c) 1985-2023 StataCorp LLC, College Station, TX, USA. All rights reserved.

